UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY BEFORE THE ADMINISTRATOR

In the Matter of:		Docket No. TSCA-05-2011-0021	3	Ä
Patrick Wilber;)	Honorable M. Lisa Buschmann	3 1	
YaYa Milwaukee, LLC; and)	Presiding Administrative Law Judge	N 2	
Sancho Properties, LLC)			
Milwaukee, Wisconsin)	INCLUDES EXHIBITS CLAIMED AS	1	
)	CONFIDENTIAL BUSINESS INFORM		53
Respondents.)	AND PERSONAL PRIVACY INFORM	ATION	
)			

COMPLAINANT'S INITIAL PREHEARING EXCHANGE

The United States Environmental Protection Agency, Region 5 ("U.S. EPA" or "Complainant"), in accordance with the March 15, 2012, Prehearing Order (Prehearing Order) issued by Presiding Officer, M. Lisa Buschmann, respectfully submits the following *Complainant's Initial Prehearing Exchange* pursuant to Section 22.19 of the Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties, Issuance of Compliance or Corrective Action Orders, and the Revocation, Termination or Suspension of Permits (Consolidated Rules), codified at 40 C.F.R. § 22.19.

I. EXPECTED WITNESSES

This section includes the names of witnesses Complainant intends to call, together with a brief narrative summary of each witnesses' expected testimony as required by Paragraph I.A of the Prehearing Order.

A. <u>Fact Witnesses</u>

Complainant may call the following individuals to testify as fact witnesses:

Leslie Blake: Leslie Blake is an Environmental Engineer with the Land and Chemicals Division, U.S. EPA, Region 5. Ms. Blake's duties include serving as an enforcement officer and a case developer in the investigation of lead disclosure violations under the Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA). She also maintains the official enforcement records for investigations that she is assigned, including but not limited to, records related to investigation of compliance with TSCA by Mr. Patrick Wilber and associated companies. Ms. Blake will testify regarding her review of the documents contained in the official enforcement file for the Wilber case (Wilber case file). Those documents include, but are not limited to, lease agreements, disclosure statements, information requests and inspection reports related to compliance with Section 1018 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, 42 U.S.C. § 4852d, and its implementing regulations, particularly 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F (Lead Disclosure Rule).

Ms. Blake will provide the Court with testimony on the Lead Disclosure program and the critical importance of timely, accurate and full disclosure to protecting human health. She may testify as to her knowledge of the effects of lead on children and other sensitive populations. She will testify as to her review of the evidence compiled as a result of Complainant's regulatory oversight of Respondents' rental businesses, and the factual basis for her determination that Respondents violated TSCA and the Lead Disclosure Rule as alleged in the Complaint.

Ms. Blake will also testify as to how she calculated the penalty proposed by applying the statutory penalty factors set forth within Section 16(a)(2)(B) of TSCA, 15 U.S.C.

¹ The Land and Chemicals Division was formerly known as the Waste, Pesticides and Toxics Division. The Chemicals Management Branch was formerly known as the Pesticides and Toxics Branch, and the Pesticides/Toxics Compliance Section was formerly known as the Pesticides and Toxics Enforcement Section.

§ 2615(a)(2)(B), as explained by U.S. EPA's <u>Section 1018 - Disclosure Rule Enforcement</u>

Response and Penalty Policy, dated December 2007, and as set forth in greater detail in

Complainant's Exhibit 31 (CX 31). She will offer her assessment of the appropriateness of the penalty proposed in the Complaint, considering the nature, circumstances, extent, and gravity of the violations, and with respect to the facts she was aware of related to Respondents' ability to pay,² effect of ability to continue to do business, any history of prior such violations, the degree of culpability, and such other matters as justice may require.

Ms. Blake will testify regarding the delegation of authority pertaining to the Complaint. She will testify as to the factual allegations contained in the Complaint which establish Respondents' liability for the violations alleged in the Complaint. If necessary, Ms. Blake may authenticate certain exhibits included in this prehearing exchange or subsequent prehearing exchanges. Ms. Blake may testify, as necessary, to respond to assertions raised by the Respondents.

2. <u>Maureen O'Neill</u>. Ms. O'Neill is a Civil Investigator in the Office of Regional Counsel, U.S. EPA, Region 5. Ms. O'Neill performs investigative work in support of the civil prosecution of environmental violations. Ms. O'Neill's duties include interviewing potential witnesses and other individuals who may have pertinent information; locating people of interest; performing public records searches to obtain evidence relating to property ownership, asset transfers, and other financial information; and drafting reports to document the findings of her investigations. Ms. O'Neill may be called to testify regarding her investigation into Respondents. Ms. O'Neill's testimony may include, but may not be limited to, testimony about

² Complainant reserves the right to identify a financial expert in its Rebuttal Prehearing Exchange if the Respondents raise ability to pay as a defense in their Prehearing Exchange.

the following investigative activities: internet investigations into ownership of real property, personal property and other assets associated with Respondents; investigations into the estimated current fair market value of real property, personal property and other assets associated with Respondents; investigation into the disposition of real property, personal property, and other assets associated with Respondents; investigation of liens and other liabilities relating to Respondents; investigation of Respondents' associations with other corporate, partnership or other business entities; and investigations of the background of potential witnesses. If necessary, Ms. O'Neill will provide testimony sufficient to authenticate the documents and other exhibits that she relied upon to conduct her investigations. Ms. O'Neill may also testify, as necessary, to respond to assertions or arguments raised by Respondents.

B. <u>Expert Witnesses</u>

Complainant may call as witnesses experts who can testify on the impact of lead poisoning on children from lead-based paint and the importance of the Lead Disclosure rule in preventing children from becoming lead-poisoned. Due to funding issues the Complainant is not able to provide the name of such a witness at this time but reserves the right to timely supplement this Prehearing Exchange with the name and curriculum vitae.

II. DOCUMENTS AND EXHIBITS

Copies of documents and exhibits which Complainant intends to introduce into evidence at the hearing are attached hereto as Complainant's Exhibits, and are numbered sequentially. An index to those documents is attached. Complainant has included documents that the Court ordered to be exchanged in Paragraphs I.A.2, B.1 and B.3 of the Prehearing Order.

Complainant reserves the right to add additional exhibits to rebut Respondents'

testimony.

III. <u>DETERMINATION OF THE PROPOSED PENALTY AMOUNT</u>

In this matter, Leslie Blake made the penalty determinations for Complainant. A narrative of how the penalty was calculated and the facts considered is included as CX 31.

IV. APPLICATION OF THE PAPERWORK REDUCTION ACT

As stated in Paragraph I.B.4 of the Prehearing Order, the Presiding Officer directed Complainant to provide its position regarding the applicability of the Paperwork Reduction Act (PRA), 44 U.S.C. § 3501 et seq., to this proceeding, including whether there is a current Office of Management and Budget (OMB) control number involved and whether the provisions of Section 3512 of the PRA may apply to this case.

The PRA does apply to the information collection requirements of the lead-paint disclosure rule at 40 C.F.R. Part 745, Subpart F. U.S. EPA obtained OMB approval of the information collection requirements and the OMB control number assigned to the information collection requirements in the rule is 2070-0151. According to the preamble to the final rule, the rule contains the following information collection requirements: (1) disclosure of known lead-based paint and/or lead-based paint hazards; (2) provision of any available records and reports pertaining to lead-based paint in the housing; (3) provision of a federally-approved lead hazard information pamphlet; (4) completion and subsequent retention of disclosure and acknowledgment for 3 years; and (5) provision of a 10-day evaluation opportunity to purchasers before obligation under purchase contracts. See 61 Fed. Reg. 9081, March 6, 1996.

On May 31, 1996, U.S. EPA issued a notice in the Federal Register (61 Fed. Reg. 27348) to announce that on April 22, 1996, OMB had approved the information collection requirements

contained in 40 C.F.R. §§ 745.107, 745.110, 745.113, and 745.115. This notice stated that OMB control number 2070-0151 had been assigned to these collection activities, and was valid through April 30, 1999. On July 1, 1996 (61 Fed. Reg. 33851), U.S. EPA amended the table in 40 C.F.R. Part 9 to add this OMB control number to the listing of OMB control numbers for U.S. EPA's regulations that appear in Section 9.1. See 64 Fed. Reg. 39418 (July 22, 1999). The control number was renewed on September 28, 2001 (66 Fed. Reg. 49664), November 30, 2004 (69 Fed. Reg. 69598-69599) and on April 4, 2008 (73 Fed. Reg. 20037) authorizing collection of information through March 30, 2011.³

The transactions alleged in the Complaint occurred from November 1, 2006 through May 12, 2008. There were no lapses in this OMB control number during the period of noncompliance cited in the Complaint. Thus, Complainant has fully complied with the PRA with respect to the counts at issue in this proceeding.

V. LOCATION AND LENGTH OF HEARING

As required by Paragraph I.A.3 of the Prehearing Order, Complainant requests that the hearing in this matter be held at a suitable location in or near Milwuakee, Wisconsin. This is where Respondent, Patrick Wilber, resides and conducts the business which the hearing concerns.

Complainant anticipates needing approximately 1 to 2 days to present its direct case. No translation services are needed for the Complainant or its witnesses.

VI. JUDICIAL NOTICE

Complainant hereby requests the Presiding Officer to take judicial notice of the

³ On March 2, 2011, EPA submitted to OMB EPA ICR No. 1710.06 (OMB Control Number 2070-0151) for review and approval, (76 Fed. Reg. 11451). Under OMB rules the Agency may continue to conduct or sponsor the collection of information while this submission is pending at OMB.

following:

1. The Toxic Substances Control Act (TSCA), 15 U.S.C. § 2601 et seq., and the

regulations promulgated thereunder;

2. The Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1992, 42 U.S.C.

§§ 4851-56, including the legislative history, and the regulations promulgated thereunder;

3. The Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of

Civil Penalties, 40 C.F.R. Part 22, as amended, including 61 Fed. Reg. 9064, March 6, 1996; and

4. Federal Register notices pertaining to OMB information collection requirements.

VII. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

Complainant respectfully reserves the right to call all witnesses called by the Respondents, to call the Respondent, Patrick Wilber, to recall any of Respondents' witnesses in rebuttal, and to modify or supplement the names of witnesses and exhibits prior to the Adjudicatory Hearing, pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 22, and upon adequate notice to the

Respectfully submitted,

Richard J. Clarizio

Associate Regional Counsel

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Respondents and the Presiding Officer.

Region 5 (C-14J)

77 West Jackson Blvd.

Chicago, IL 60604

Telephone: (312) 886-0559 Facsimile: (312) 582-5889

D'EGEIVED

REGIONAL HEARING CLERK U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY In the Matter of Patrick Wilber, YaYa Milwaukee, LLC and Sancho Properties, LLC Docket No. TSCA-05-2011-0021

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that today I filed the *Complainant's Initial Prehearing Exchange* in the manner indicated below.

Original and one copy

LaDawn Whitehead Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. EPA, Region 5, E-19J 77 W. Jackson, 13th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60604-3590

By UPS

The Honorable Lisa M. Buschmann Office of Administrative Law Judges U.S. EPA Mail Code 1099 14th Street, N.W. Suite 350 Washington D.C. 20005

Patrick Wilber 3201 North Holton Street Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53212

11	10		9	∞	7	6	O _i	4.	ω	2 Pi	I P	CX Bu Number Inf
							CBI			Privacy	Privacy	Confident ial Business Informati on (CBI)
5/13/2008	12/1/2007		10/16/2007	8/20/1996	3/19/1996	9/10/1980	Various Dates	Undated	Undated	Various Dates	Various Dates	Date
Notes of 5/13/2008 inspection.	Section 1018 – Disclosure Rule Enforcement Response and Penalty Policy.	Attachment 2006 Federal Income tax return (unsigned & undated). Attachment 2006 Wisconsin Income tax return (unsigned & undated).	Letter from M.T. Whattker, A1 Accounting & Income Tax, LLC to Patrick Wilbur, re: 2006 Federal and State Income tax returns with attached returns.	Interpretive Guidance for the Real Estate Community on the Requirements for Disclosure of Information Concerning Lead-Based Paint in Housing, USEPA, Office of Pollution Prevention and Toxics.	EPA & HUD Fact Sheet - Disclosure of Lead-Based Paint Hazards in Housing.	Guidelines for the Assessment of Civil Penalties under Section 16 of the Toxic Substances Control Act; PCB Penalty Policy (45 Fed. Reg. 59770).	Dunn & Bradstreet Reports various companies and names.	Wisconsin Real Estate Broker information including credential summary for Patrick Wilber; Real Estate Broker Licensing requirements and regulations.	City of Milwaukee Neighborhood Services System - Property List - Patrick Wilber.	Tenant Lease Agreements for Section 8 Housing.	Rental Agreements for properties identified in the Complaint.	Title
CX-000333 - CX-000335	CX-000297 - CX-000332		CX-000188 - CX-000296	CX-000174 - CX-000187	CX-000171 - CX-000173	CX-000162 - CX-000170	CX-000136 - CX-000161	CX-000123 - CX-000135	CX-000050 - CX-000122	CX-000042 - CX-000049	CX-000001 - CX-000041	Bates Number

16	15	14										13	12
6/7/2011 received	5/18/2011	4/1/2011										10/29/2008	10/27/2008
6/7/2011 received Letter from Patrick Wilber to Julie Morris, USEPA re: PFN.	Patrick Wilber, re: Notice of Intent to File Administrative Complaint (PFN) without enclosure. Signed Certified Mail Receipt attached.	American Healthy Homes Survey - Lead and Arsenic Findings - U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. Letter from Mardi Klevs, Chief, Chemicals Management Branch (CMB) to	Attachment F 5/13/2008 Receipt for Documents signed by Edward R. Pliney and Patrick A. Wilber.	Affidavit Responding to the Information Request Letter signed by Patrick Wilbur.	Attachment E 7/18/2008 Letter from Patrick Wilber re: Response to Requested Information.	Attachment E 7/3/2008 Letter from USEPA to Patrick Wilbur re: Request for Information with attachments.	Attachment D 4/23/2008 compliance with Section 1018 with certified return receipt card.	Letter from Edward R. Pliny, Multi-Program	Attachment C 12/12/2007 Correct Condition of Premises - 1101 S. 19th	Attachment B 5/13/2008 Confidentiality Notice - signed Patrick Wilber. City of Milwaukee Health Department - Order to	Attachment A 5/13/2008 Lead Paint - Notice of Inspection - signed Edward R. Pliney and Patrick Wilber.	Inspection Report - Section 1018 of the Residential Lead-Based Paint Hazard Reduction Act of 1982 - May 13, 2008, inspection signed Edward R. Pliney.	Memo from Edward R. Pliny to File re: Milwaukee Order to Correct Condtion of Premises located at 12/12/2007 for 1101 S. 19th with Order, receipt and notes.
CX-000493 - CX-000495	CX-000487 - CX-000492	CX-000372 - CX-000486								•		CX-000343 - CX-000371	CX-000336 - CX-000342

22	21							70.000.700.000		20	19	18	17
		CBI) 	CBI	CBI	CBI	CBI	CBI	CBI	CBI			
9/16/2011	8/31/2011									8/22/2011	8/3/2011	7/15/2011	6/24/2011
Sale/Just Sold Realty Inc., Sancho Properties, LLC, YaYa Milwaukee, LLC.	with enclosures.	Attachment Patrick Wilber ie: Ability to Pay Information CX-000720 - CX-000735		Attachment 2007 unsigend Wisconsin Tax Return Patrick Wilber (undated).	Attachment and YaYa Milwaukee, LLC (undated).	Attachment (unsigned and undated).	Attachment and Sancho Properties (undated).	Attachment (unsigned and undated).	Attachment 2009 unsigned Federal Tax Return Patrick Wilber and Sancho Properties (dated 4-14-2010).	Letter from Patrick Wilber to Julie Morris, PTCS re: Tax returns 2007-2009 and 2010 tax extension with attached tax returns.	City of Milwaukee Housing Authority to Leslie Blake, USEPA re: Lead Disclosure forms for three properties.	information with enclosed Disclosure Statements (35 pages), copy of 7/3/08 USEPA request for information, and certified mail receipt. E-mail chain between Pooja Dhaliwal, Section 8 Assistant Program Director,	Letter from Patrick Wilber to Scott Cooper, Pesticides and Toxics Compliance Sec. (PTCS) re: Disclosure Statement 1101 S. 19th with enclosed Disclosure Statements (2 pages). Letter from Patrick Wilber to Julie Morris, PTCS re: Requested property/tenant
· CANOUCLES - CAN OUGH IS	CX-000735 - CX-000749	CX-000720 - CX-000735								CX-000547 - CX-000719	CX-000542 - CX-000546	CX-000501 - CX-000541	CX-000496 - CX-000500

Various Dates	Undated	Various Dates	Undated	4/11/2012	11/17/2011	11/2/2011		10/11/2011		9/26/2011	
City of Milwaukee Neighborhood Services System - Property List - Patrick Wilber.	Penalty Narrative and Matrix.	Headquarters and Region 5 Delegations 12-1 and 12-2A.	Manta Company Profile - Sancho Properties.	E-mail chain between Roemary Binder, City of Milwaukee and Leslie Blake, USEPA re: Lead Orders for Wilber properties.	certificate of service and mailing label. Answer in TSCA-05-2011-0021 with certificate of service and mailing label.	request for hearing with attachments. Order and Notice of Exclusion. Answer in TSCA-05-2011-0021 with	of service, UPS shipping label and UPS confirmation tracking detail. Letter from Patrick Wilber to Margaret guerriero (sic) re: TSCA-05-2011-0021 CX-000833 - CX-000838	YaYa Milwaukee, LLC and Sancho Properties, LLC re: In the Matter of Patrick Wilber, Docket No.: TSCA-05-2011-0021 with attached complaint, certificate	postal service return mail stamp. Letter from Richard J. Clarizio, Associate Regional Counsel to Patrick Wilber,	(LCD) to YaYa Milwaukee, LLC re: In the Matter of Patrick Wilbur, Docket No.: TSCA-05-2011-0021, with attached complaint, certificate of service and	Letter from Margaret M. Guerriero, Director, Land and Chemicals Division
CX-000881 - CX-000907	CX-000860 - CX-000880	CX-000853 - CX-000859	CX-000850 - CX-000852	CX-000848 - CX-000849	CX-000843 - CX-000847	CX-000839 - CX-000842	CX-000833 - CX-000838		CX-000790 - CX-000832		CX-000750 - CX-000789

24
25
26
26
27
27
27
28
29
30
31
31

23